Why should we be tolerant? What does it mean to 'live and let live'? What ought to be tolerated and what not?

Toleration: A Critical Introduction is a comprehensive and accessible philosophical introduction to the theory and practice of toleration. The first part of the book clearly introduces and assesses the major theories of toleration through an exploration of accounts based on scepticism, value pluralism and the demands of reasonableness. Catriona McKinnon also draws on major liberal thinkers – from Locke and Mill to Rawls and Feinberg – in order to examine the relation between harm and toleration.

In the second part of the book, McKinnon applies the theories of toleration to urgent contemporary problems such as female circumcision, the French headscarves affair, artistic freedom, pornography and censorship, and Holocaust denial.

Toleration: A Critical Introduction provides a solid theoretical base for the value of toleration, while considering the detail of challenges to toleration in practice. It is an ideal starting point for those coming to the topic for the first time, and for anyone interested in the challenges facing toleration today.

Catriona McKinnon is Lecturer in Politics at the University of Reading. She is the author of Liberalism and the Defence of Political Constructivism (2002), and co-editor of The Culture of Toleration in Diverse Societies: Reasonable Tolerance (2003) and The Demands of Citizenship (2000).
Why should we be tolerant? What does it mean to ‘live and let live’? What ought to be tolerated and what not?

*Toleration: A Critical Introduction* is a comprehensive and accessible philosophical introduction to the theory and practice of toleration. The first part of the book clearly introduces and assesses the major theories of toleration through an exploration of accounts based on scepticism, value pluralism and the demands of reasonableness. Catriona McKinnon also draws on major liberal thinkers – from Locke and Mill to Rawls and Feinberg – in order to examine the relation between harm and toleration.

In the second part of the book, McKinnon applies the theories of toleration to urgent contemporary problems such as female circumcision, the French headscarves affair, artistic freedom, pornography and censorship, and Holocaust denial.

*Toleration: A Critical Introduction* provides a solid theoretical base for the value of toleration, while considering the detail of challenges to toleration in practice. It is an ideal starting point for those coming to the topic for the first time, and for anyone interested in the challenges facing toleration today.

**Catriona McKinnon** is Lecturer in Politics at the University of Reading. She is the author of *Liberalism and the Defence of Political Constructivism* (2002), and co-editor of *The Culture of Tolerance in Diverse Societies: Reasonable Tolerance* (2003) and *The Demands of Citizenship* (2000).
Routledge Contemporary Political Philosophy
Edited by David Archard, University of St. Andrews
and Ronald Beiner, University of Toronto

Routledge Contemporary Political Philosophy is an exciting new series for students of philosophy and political theory. Designed for those who have already completed an introductory philosophy or politics course, each book in the series introduces and critically assesses a major topic in political philosophy. Long-standing topics are refreshed and more recent ones made accessible for those coming to often complex issues and arguments for the first time. After introducing the topic in question, each book clearly explains the central problems involved in understanding the arguments for and against competing theories. Relevant contemporary examples are used throughout to illuminate the problems and theories concerned, making the series essential reading not only for philosophy and politics students but also those in related disciplines such as sociology and law. Each book in the series is written by an experienced author and teacher with special knowledge of the topic, providing a valuable resource for both students and teachers alike.

Also available in the series:

**Theories of Democracy**
*Frank Cunningham*

Forthcoming titles include:

**Rights**
*Tom Campbell*

**Equality**
*Melissa Williams*

**Public Reason and Deliberation**
*Simone Chambers*
Toleration

A critical introduction

Catriona McKinnon
For Matt, with love.
# Contents

_Acknowledgements_ viii

**PART I**

1 Toleration: a call to arms 3
2 Opposition and restraint 18
3 Toleration from scepticism 35
4 Toleration from value pluralism 52
5 Toleration from reasonableness 67
6 Political harm: the liberal paradigm 81

**PART II**

7 Culture and citizenship: headscarves and circumcision 101
8 Artistic expression 119
9 Pornography and censorship 137
10 Holocaust denial 153
11 Conclusion: new challenges for liberal toleration 172

*Notes* 175
_Bibliography* 202
*Index* 211
This book started life as a series of graduate seminars on Contemporary Issues in Toleration that I taught at the University of York in 2000–2. The master's students who participated in the seminars gave me acute comments on the material, and much food for thought; my first debt of gratitude is to them. As a result of conversations about toleration and its problems, Dave Archard – as an editor of the series in which this book appeared – suggested that I undertake the project. I would like to thank him for his advice, support, and encouragement, all of which have been heartening and sound. Similarly, Tony Bruce at Routledge has been a great help and source of guidance; my thanks to him, the three anonymous readers of the original proposal and all at Routledge.

All that is really necessary for writing a book like this is access to a good library, correspondence with people who are thinking about the same things, and time. On the latter front, I have incurred a number of debts. The bulk of my writing was done while on leave from the University of York; I would like to thank the university, and my ex-colleagues in the Department of Politics, for granting me a sabbatical term as part of this leave. During this sabbatical term I spent a wonderful month as a Fellow in Philosophy at the Liguria Study Centre in Bogliasco near Genoa. I would like to thank the Bogliasco Foundation in New York for this award, and Sue Mendus and Hillel Steiner for their support in making the application. At the study centre itself, Alan Rowlin was the perfect host; I thank him for his company. In addition, I would like to thank the other Fellows whose company during my month in Genoa made the experience even more memorable; in particular, Danny Anderson, Jeffery Cotton, Bob and Florence Fogelin, and John and Brigitte Reader (and special thanks to Bob for very helpful discussion of chapter 3).

I acquired further time to work on the book through the award of a Study Abroad Fellowship from the Leverhulme Trust; for their references for this award, and their cheerful toleration of my seemingly incessant requests for their support, I would like to thank in the warmest terms Iain Hampsher-Monk, Hillel Steiner and Jo Wolff. My Fellowship was originally to have been spent at the Centre for Applied Philosophy and Public Ethics in the Department of Philosophy, University of Melbourne, and I would like to thank Tony Coady, Jeremy Moss and all at CAPPE for helping to make the necessary arrangements.
However, I was unable to enact my original plans due to poor health, and instead spent the period of the Fellowship as an Associate Research Fellow in the Philosophy Programme of the School of Advanced Study, University of London. I am extremely grateful to the staff at the Leverhulme Trust – in particular, Jean Cater and Bridget Kerr – for enabling me to change the arrangements for my Study Abroad Fellowship with the minimum of fuss; they prevented what was a very stressful time from becoming impossibly so. The same is true for Tim Crane who, as Director of the Philosophy Programme, arranged a Research Fellowship for me at short notice without hassle. My sincere thanks to all of them. Finally, on the time front, I would like to thank my new colleagues in the Department of Politics and International Relations at the University of Reading for securing a workload which made it possible for me to finish the book (almost) on schedule despite taking up a new contract there, and for the friendly welcome they have given me.

With respect to correspondence on the material in the book, I have been lucky in having detailed written feedback from Gideon Calder (on chapter 11), Paula Casal (on chapter 8), Bob Fogelin (on chapter 2), John Horton (on virtually the whole manuscript), and Cécile Laborde (on chapter 8). In addition, Alan Haworth and Stephen Newman provided very helpful comments on the penultimate draft. I would like to thank them all for taking the time to think about what I think, and for having the generosity to share their thoughts with me. In particular, I would like to thank John Horton for his extremely acute and constructive comments, and for his continuing support. Material from the book has, in one form or another, been presented in research seminars at the following institutions: the Universities of Brighton, Exeter, Manchester, Oxford, Reading, York, and the London School of Economics. I am grateful for the invitations to speak at these venues, and to the audiences who attended for their comments.

My final set of debts are personal. The experience of writing this book was marred by a serious health scare when I was far from home. At times like that you learn who you can rely on, and I would like to thank Havi Carel, Karen Chung, Cécile Laborde and Nigel Pleasants for their friendship. My family – my dad, Jim; my sister, Fiona; my brother-in-law, Pete; and my lovely niece, Mads – stick by me with love whatever the circumstances, but over the last two years have been the best family anyone could hope for. Finally, I would like to thank Matt Pittori, whose reappearance in my life brought me up for air, and whose daily presence makes my heart race: I dedicate this book to him with more love than I used to think possible.